



SINDH EDUCATION FOUNDATION

Government of Sindh



TENDER ATTENDANCE SLIP

Date: 27TH MARCH, 2017

Tender No. SEF/WEB/16-17/16

Tender of: HIRING OF INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANT REQUIRED FOR TAX MATTER.

Following firms submitted their Proposals in this IFB.

S.No.	NAME OF PARTICPANT FIRM	ATTENDED BY (Name)	CONTACT (Cell #)	SIGNATURES
1	Mr. Malik Altaf Javed	Absent	0300-8213077	Absent
2	Mr. Ellahi Bukhtsh Qureshi	Absent	0333-7123927	Absent
3	Mr. Suneel Ali Memon	Absent	0312-3000734	Absent
4	Mr. Noman Iftikhar Khuwaja	Absent	0314-4027861	Absent
5				
6				
7				
8				
9				
10				

Handwritten signature
27/3/17



SINDH EDUCATION FOUNDATION



Government of Sindh

ATTENDANCE

HIRING OF INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANT REQUIRED FOR TAX MATTER

(SEF/WEB/16-17/16)

DATE: 27TH MARCH, 2017

INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE & CO-OPTED MEMBER

Sign: _____

Ali Nisar
27/3/2017
Mr. Ali Nisar
Senior Officer, ICC
Co-opted Member CSC,
Sindh Education Foundation,
Govt. of Sindh,

Sign: _____

Nawab Zafar Ali
27/3/2017
Mr. Nawab Zafar Ali
Deputy Director (M&E)
Secretary/Member Consultant Selection
Committee
Sindh Education Foundation
Govt. of Sindh

Muhammad Abdullah Abbasi
27/3/17
Mr. Muhammad Abdullah Abbasi

Director General Administration & Co-ordination
Chairman of Individual Consultant Selection Committee
Sindh Education Foundation
Govt. of Sindh



SINDH EDUCATION FOUNDATION



Government of Sindh

SUBJECT: MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE HELD ON 27th MARCH 2017 AT 3.30 P.M

Meeting of the Consultant Selection Committee was held at 3.30 pm on 27th March 2017 in the conference room, Sindh Education Foundation, Karachi. The Committee had Co-opted the following as member (Co-opted) of the Committee.

- Senior Officer, Internal Control & Compliance, SEF, (Co-opted Member, Consultant Selection Committee), SEF for Hiring of Individual Consultant required for Tax Matter

The Chair of the Committee briefed the participants of the Committee about the agenda of the meeting. The Agenda of the meeting is given below:

OPENING OF CURRICULUM VITAE (CVs):

1. Hiring of Individual Consultant required for Tax Matter (SEF/WEB/16-17/16).

The participants of the meeting were informed that Hiring of Individual Consultant required for Tax Matter was advertised on SEF official website on 17th March, 2017. Last date for submitting CVs were 24th March, 2017 and opening date of CVs were 27th March, 2017. In response to the RFP, the following four Individuals submitted their Curriculum Vitae (CVs):

- 1) Mr. Malik Altaf Javaid
- 2) Mr. Ellahi Bukhsh Qureshi
- 3) Mr. Suneel Ali Memon
- 4) Mr. Noman Iftikhar Khuwaja

In response to aforementioned RFP, Curriculum Vitae (CVs) of all aforesaid individuals were received and same were opened in the meeting and subsequently was signed by all the members of the Committee.

The Committee recommended to take necessary action in the matter.



SINDH EDUCATION FOUNDATION



Government of Sindh

HIRING OF INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANT REQUIRED FOR TAX MATTER

(SEF/WEB/16-17/16)

DATE: 27TH MARCH, 2017

INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE & CO-OPTED MEMBER

Sign: _____

Mr. Ali Nisar
Senior Officer, ICC
Co-opted Member CSC,
Sindh Education Foundation,
Govt. of Sindh,

Sign: _____

Mr. Nawab Zafar Ali
Deputy Director (M&E)
Secretary/Member Consultant Selection
Committee
Sindh Education Foundation
Govt. of Sindh

Mr. Muhammad Abdullah Abbasi
Director (General Administration & Co-ordination)
Chairman of Consultant Selection Committee
Sindh Education Foundation
Govt. of Sindh



SINDH EDUCATION FOUNDATION

Government of Sindh



ATTENDANCE FOR INTERVIEW

HIRING OF INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANT REQUIRED FOR TAX MATTER

(SEF/WEB/16-17/16)

DATE: 29TH MARCH, 2017

INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE & CO-OPTED MEMBER

Sign: _____

Mr. Ali Nisar
Senior Officer, ICC
Co-opted Member CSC,
Sindh Education Foundation,
Govt. of Sindh,

Sign: _____

Mr. Nawab Zafar Ali
Deputy Director (M&E)
Secretary/Member Consultant Selection
Committee
Sindh Education Foundation
Govt. of Sindh

Mr. Muhammad Abdullah Abbasi
Director General Administration & Co-ordination
Chairman of Individual Consultant Selection Committee
Sindh Education Foundation
Govt. of Sindh

SINDH EDUCATION FOUNDATION

HIRING OF TAX CONSULTANT

EVALUATION SHEET (Based on CV & Interview)

S #	Skills & Competencies	Quantative Scores	Mr. Noman Khawaja	Mr. Eliahi Baksh Qureshi	Mr. Suneel Ali Memon	Mr. Malik Altaf
1	Degree in law from recognized university or Member of Professional body of Accountant	20	0	20	20	20
2	Registered with Tax Bar Association & FBR as "I-E"	10	10	10	0	5
3	Relevant experience of in practicing Tax related matters	10	10	5	3	7
		10	10	0	0	0
4	A prior experience of working with NGOs/INGOs in similar position and dealing with related matters will be preferred.	10	10	10	10	0
5	Able to handle with complicated and complex Tax issues	10	10	10	3	5
6	Strong interpersonal communication skills & adhere strong professionalism behaviour skills & confidence	10	10	10	10	10
7	Able to represent Foundation before the tax authorities	10	10	10	5	10
8	Able to file statutory returns & statements	10	10	10	10	10
Total Score		100	80	85	61	67

Ali Nisar

Mr. Ali Nisar

Co-opted Member

Mr. Nawab Zafar Ali




Mr. Nawab Zafar Ali

Member - Individual Consultant (Sec)

Mr. Abdullah Abbasi

Mr. Abdullah Abbasi

Chairman - Individual Consultant Selection Committee

SINDH EDUCATION FOUNDATION GOVERNMENT OF SINDH	
HIRING OF TAX CONSULTANT (Ref. SEF/WEB/16-17/16)	
Opening of CVs: March 27, 2017	
Interview Dated: March 29, 2017	
COMBINED TECHNICAL & FINANCIAL EVALUATION SHEET:	
TECHNICAL EVALUATION:	
Technical Points out of 100	Mr. Ellahi Buksh Qureshi 84
Highest Technical score as per Evaluation	1st
FINANCIAL EVALUATION:	
Financial Bid per month	140,000
Duration of Contract (in months)	2
Total Contract Price	280,000
Ranking at Consolidate Technical & Financial Marks:	
Shorlisted Individual	
Note: This sheet is consolidated and typed by the SEF Procurement Department.	
1) The Individual Consultant Selection Committee found that four CVs were received from Individual Tax Consultant Mr. Noman Iftikhar Khawaja, Mr. Ellahi Buksh Qureshi, Mr. Suneel Ali Memon & Mr. Malik Altaf.	
2) The Individual Consultant Selection Committee reviewed the documents and eligibility sheet (Based on CVs & Interviews) that initially prepared by the Co-opted Member and recommended that Mr. Ellahi Buksh Qureshi is Successful & Qualified.	
3) The Individual Consultant Selection Committee recommended to award the Contract to Mr. Ellahi Buksh Qureshi.	
INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE	
 Mr. Ali Nisar Senior Officer (IC/C) Co-opted Member - Individual Consultant Selection Committee Sindh Education Foundation Government of Sindh	 Mr. Nawab Zafar Ali Deputy Director (M&E) Secretary/Member-Individual Consultant Selection Committee Sindh Education Foundation Government of Sindh
 Mr. Muhammad Abdullah Abbasi Director (General Administration & Co-ordination) Chairman-Individual Consultant Selection Committee Sindh Education Foundation Government of Sindh	

From: Hamid Ahmed [mailto:hamid.ahmed@sef.org.pk]
Sent: Friday, May 05, 2017 3:02 PM
To: altaf_javid@hotmail.com
Cc: naheedsd@gmail.com; mabdullahabbasi@gmail.com; Shahnawaz khan (shahnawaz.khan@sef.org.pk); m.asif@sef.org.pk; 'sadaruddin.jagerani'; ali.nisar@sef.org.pk; dd.mne.sef@gmail.com
Subject: FW: Intimation Letter for sharing Technical Evaluation Sheet of Hiring of Individual Consultant for Tax Matter

Dear Sir

With reference to your reservation, the followings for your kind information

Thanks

Hamid Ahmed
Officer Procurement
SEF

From: Hamid Ahmed [mailto:hamid.ahmed@sef.org.pk]
Sent: Friday, May 05, 2017 2:56 PM
To: 'altaf_javid@hotmail.com'
Cc: naheedsd@gmail.com; mabdullahabbasi@gmail.com; Shahnawaz khan (shahnawaz.khan@sef.org.pk); m.asif@sef.org.pk; 'sadaruddin.jagerani'; ali.nisar@sef.org.pk; dd.mne.sef@gmail.com
Subject: FW: Intimation Letter for sharing Technical Evaluation Sheet of Hiring of Individual Consultant for Tax Matter

From: Ali Nisar [mailto:ali.nisar@sef.org.pk]
Sent: Friday, May 05, 2017 1:02 PM
To: 'Hamid Ahmed'
Cc: 'Shahnawaz khan'; m.asif@sef.org.pk
Subject: RE: Intimation Letter for sharing Technical Evaluation Sheet of Hiring of Individual Consultant for Tax Matter

Dear Hamid sb

As you are aware that the points are awarded based on the interview and CV submitted, by the committee member.

However, below is the clarification on the concerns raised by Mr. Altaf Javid.

I just can't understand how a person who is not even able to represent SEF at all levels have been given ten points and I have been given five points . It is clarify you that a committee has given you 10points on this, please check point number 7 "Able to represent Foundation before the tax authorities".

i am also unable to understand as to how you have gauged that I am unable or less able to deal complicated tax issues . This is based on your CV and Interview conducted.

it is highly doubtful as to how a person who is not even a practicing advocate has been given scores. This is to clarify you that a highest scorer is an advocate, and such an allegation is not acceptable.

I hope this clarify the matter.

Regards
Ali Nisar

From: Ali Nisar [mailto:ali.nisar@sef.org.pk]
Sent: Friday, April 28, 2017 1:13 PM
To: 'Hamid Ahmed' <hamid.ahmed@sef.org.pk>
Cc: 'Shahnawaz khan' <shahnawaz.khan@sef.org.pk>; 'm.asif@sef.org.pk' <m.asif@sef.org.pk>
Subject: RE: Intimation Letter for sharing Technical Evaluation Sheet of Hiring of Individual Consultant for Tax Matter

Dear Hamid sb

As you are aware that the points are awarded based on the interview and CV submitted, by the committee member.

Further, the accusation of the individual on other applicants without meeting them and without going through their CV is improper and unacceptable.

Regards
Ali Nisar

From: Hamid Ahmed [mailto:hamid.ahmed@sef.org.pk]
Sent: Friday, April 28, 2017 12:53 PM
To: ali.nisar@sef.org.pk
Cc: Shahnawaz khan <shahnawaz.khan@sef.org.pk>; m.asif@sef.org.pk
Subject: FW: Intimation Letter for sharing Technical Evaluation Sheet of Hiring of Individual Consultant for Tax Matter

Dear Sir Ali

For your kind information and ready reference

Thanks

Hamid Ahmed

From: Altaf Javid [mailto:altaf_javid@hotmail.com]
Sent: Thursday, April 27, 2017 6:41 PM
To: Hamid Ahmed; Naheedsd Durrani; Rafique Mustafa
Subject: Re: Intimation Letter for sharing Technical Evaluation Sheet of Hiring of Individual Consultant for Tax Matter

Dear Hamid,

Apparently, i have been knocked out in a highly technical manner. I just cant understand how a person who is not even able to represent SEF at all levels have been given ten points and i have been given five points. i am also unable to understand as to how you have gauged that i am unable or less able to deal complicated tax issues. it is highly doubtful as to how a person who is not even a practising advocate has been given scores, when he was not even eligible to participate in the tender.

Nawab Zafar was not in the interview panel, how he has opined. I reserve my right to seek appropriate remedy.

Regards

Malik Altaf Javid
Advocate

From: Hamid Ahmed <hamid.ahmed@sef.org.pk>
Sent: Thursday, April 27, 2017 5:54 PM
To: ellahibuxq@yahoo.com; altaf_javid@hotmail.com; noman@softax.com.pk; alimemon110.am@gmail.com
Cc: naheedsd@gmail.com; mabdullahabbasi@gmail.com; Shahnawaz khan; m.asif@sef.org.pk; 'sadaruddin.jagerani'; dd.mne.sef@gmail.com; ali.nisar@sef.org.pk
Subject: Intimation Letter for sharing Technical Evaluation Sheet of Hiring of Individual Consultant for Tax Matter

Dear Concern,

The evaluation process of submitted CVs has been completed; therefore the Evaluation Sheet (Based on CVs & Interview) is enclosed for your intimation.

Thank you for participating in the referred tender.

Best Regards,

Hamid Ahmed
Officer Procurement
SEF